

TM/SC/194

PRIVILEGES AND PROCEDURES COMMITTEE

(13th Meeting)

7th July 2015**PART A**

All members were present.

Connétable L. Norman of St. Clement, Chairman
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf
 Connétable D.W. Mezbourian of St. Lawrence
 (not present for item Nos. A6-A7)
 Connétable C.H. Taylor of St. John
 Deputy J.A. Martin of St. Helier
 Deputy S.Y. Mézec of St. Helier
 Deputy S.M. Brée of St. Clement

In attendance -

L.M. Hart, Deputy Greffier of the States
 A.C. Goodyear, Assistant Greffier of the States
 (for item Nos. A5-A7)
 T. McMinigal, Clerk to the Privileges and Procedures Committee

Note: The Minutes of this meeting comprise Part A and Part B.

- Minutes. A1. The Minutes of the meetings of 9th June 2015 (Part A and Part B) and 25th June 2015 (Part A only), having been previously circulated, were taken as read and were confirmed.
- States of Jersey
 Complaints Panel Report 2014.
 1386/6/1(2)
- A2. The Committee, with reference to its Minute No. A1 of 16th April 2014, considered the 2014 States of Jersey Complaints Panel Annual Report. In this connexion the Committee welcomed the Chairman Designate of the Complaints Panel, Mr G. Crill.
- The Committee was aware that the Chairman of the Complaints Panel, Mr N. Le Gresley would retire from the role on 17th July 2015 following 12 years of voluntary service. Although Mr. Le Gresley had been unable to attend the meeting, the Committee nonetheless expressed its gratitude for his dedication to the role.
- The Committee noted that the above report provided an overview of the cases handled by the Panel in 2014 and the manner in which complaints had been dealt with.
- The Committee sought feedback from the Chairman Designate regarding the effectiveness of the existing procedure. The Chairman Designate informed the Committee that the Panel would be reconstituted shortly with reappointments and new members. Once its membership had been restored, the first task of the Panel would be to review its current practices. Of particular importance was ensuring that the work of the Panel covered all intended branches of government, to include newer bodies and departments. The Chairman Designate also indicated that the Panel might seek to accelerate and improve the process governing the initial assessment of complaints. Above all, the Chairman Designate considered it crucial

for the public to be aware of the work of the Panel and for States Departments to view its contribution positively. Members noted that the Panel might attend upon a future meeting of the Committee in order to discuss potential enhancements to its own procedures.

The Committee, having noted the content of the draft report and the Chairman's forward, approved the same and agreed that it should be presented to the States in the report series at the earliest opportunity.

Members of
the States of
Jersey
Complaints
Panel.
1386/6(5)

A3. The Committee, with reference to its Minute No. A1 of 17th September 2013, received a draft proposition entitled: "States of Jersey Complaints Panel: renewal of membership". In this connexion the Committee welcomed the Chairman Designate of the Complaints Panel, Mr G. Crill.

In accordance with Article 5(2) of the Administrative Decisions (Review) (Jersey) Law 1982, it was proposed to request the States to re-appoint Mr. C. Beirne, Mr. R.F. Bonney, Mr. G. G. Marett and Mr. P. D. McGrath as members of the States of Jersey Complaints Panel for a further period of four years.

Upon enquiry, the Chairman Designate assured the Committee that the Panel retained a broad membership, with volunteers from a wide range of professional and social backgrounds.

The Committee, having considered the draft proposition, requested that it be lodged '*au Greffe*' for debate by the States at the earliest opportunity. The Committee thanked Mr. Crill for his attendance and he withdrew from the meeting.

Composition
and election of
the States
Assembly.
465/1(201)

A4. The Committee, with reference to its Minute No. A3 of 9th June 2015, received an oral update from the Deputy Greffier of the States on the activities of the Sub-Committee on the Composition and Election of the States Assembly.

The Committee recalled that the Sub-Committee's first open-forum workshop with all States Members had taken place on 2nd June 2015. A total of 32 Members had participated in the session, which had concentrated on the objectives for reform and the categories, districting and numbers of States Members. A further 8 Members had completed the survey remotely. Members noted that the results of the first seminar would be published on the States Assembly website shortly.

The Deputy Greffier reported that a meeting of the Sub-Committee had been held on 1st July 2015 to discuss the outcomes of the initial consultation and its ongoing work programme. The Committee noted that officers had secured a date of 14th July 2015 for the Sub-Committee's second open-forum workshop, which would focus on the topic of voting systems. Preparation was underway to finalise the materials to be presented at the session. Members noted that, in anticipation of the upcoming briefing, a simple and plain explanatory note on voting systems had been published on the States Assembly website for information. The Sub-Committee noted that the themes of categories, districting and numbers of States Members would be revisited at a later session.

The Committee noted the position accordingly and awaited further developments with interest.

States
procedures:
review
465/4(14)

A5. The Committee, with reference to its Minute No. A4 of 9th June 2015, received an oral update from the Assistant Greffier of the States on the activities of the Standing Orders and Internal Procedures Sub-Committee.

The Assistant Greffier reported that a meeting of the Standing Orders and Internal Procedures Sub-Committee had been held on the morning on 7th July 2015. The

13th Meeting
07.07.15

Sub-Committee had reviewed a revised version of a discussion paper previously considered by the Committee. The updated document accounted for the comments formerly made by the Committee.

The Committee noted that the Sub-Committee planned to hold a workshop with all States Members in September 2015, wherein its revised discussion paper would be shared with the wider Assembly for comment and input.

The Committee recalled that one particular discussion point had stated that *'consideration should be given to the establishment of a Business Committee for the scheduling of States Business'*. Whilst the Committee was not previously disposed to the notion of a Business Committee, it had agreed to put the matter into abeyance until Senator P.F.C. Ozouf was present and had been given the chance to explain the idea at greater length.

Senator Ozouf advised that the genesis of the idea was from a discussion with diplomat and former New Zealand parliamentarian Sir Lockwood Smith, who had expressed astonishment at the way in which States business was currently ordered (primarily by lodging date). Senator Ozouf observed that in the busy second and third years' of a States sitting it would be beneficial to arrange business in a more prioritised manner. This logical arrangement of business would be the chief function of a Business Committee.

A Business Committee might also issue guidance to Members on how long each item of business was expected to last. It was considered that the distribution of an approximate timetable prior to States sittings would provide useful information to Members and would help avoid the development of 'pinch-points', where vast quantities of business were left to be considered in short amounts of time.

In terms of the cadence of its meetings, the Business Committee could be convened either regularly or on an ad-hoc basis, when required. Senator Ozouf opined that by convening only when necessary, a Business Committee might deliver organisation during times of duress, without creating a great deal of additional bureaucracy.

Members noted the above with interest. Officers from the States Greffe undertook to research further how a Business Committee might operate in practice and to report back to the Committee at its next meeting.

On a separate but related matter, the Committee recalled that it had previously requested the Greffier of the States to liaise with the Bailiff to ensure that an announcement would be made at the end of each sitting declaring which Ministers would face questioning at the next meeting. The Committee reconsidered this direction and agreed to repeal it, believing it to be unnecessary in practice.

On-demand
audio
streaming of
meetings of the
States.
1240/10(37)

A6. The Committee considered a report which provided an assessment of the work required to make recordings of States Assembly sittings available on the States Assembly website on an on-demand basis.

The Committee recalled that on 16th June 2015, it had presented to States Members on its proposition P.39/2015, which proposed that proceedings of the States Assembly should be filmed and broadcast live on the internet and be available to view again for a period of at least 6 months. At the briefing a number of Members had suggested that the audio of States sittings should be made available on the States Assembly website. Following the session, the Information Services Department was requested to carry out an assessment of the effort required to implement such a feature. Members noted that the prospective audio facility would enable members of the public to visit the States Assembly website's

Hansard page and access the audio recording relating to a sitting as an alternative to reading the full transcript.

Upon investigation, the Information Services Department had estimated that the cost to convert the audio files into the necessary format, to store them, and to provide the Internet bandwidth used in the playback of the audio would be between £85 to £100 per month. Beyond this ongoing cost, the one-off capital cost of introducing audio playback had been valued at £11,000. This charge would be incurred in the configuration, code deployment, testing, project management and contingency work required to embed a fully-operational audio playback component on the States Assembly website. Additionally, there would be a requirement to purchase a programme to enable live audio streaming of Assembly sittings. This had been costed at £600. In operation it would connect to the same audio feed used by the BBC to broadcast States business. Members noted that an optional extra would be to enable the user to jump to a particular start position in the audio based on an index of which Member was speaking at the time. A tentative cost estimate of £5,000 was set for this feature, though this approximation was caveated by a statement that further research was required to confirm whether this aspect could actually be implemented and indeed what difficulties might lay in store.

A further caution was issued in respect of costs, as Members were advised that it was difficult to estimate the effort required to create a bespoke audio-playback system using software components already possessed by the States of Jersey. It was suggested therefore that the Committee might wish to add a further contingency above the estimate as provision for any requirements which had not been anticipated in the analysis work.

The Committee agreed that the matter of audio-streaming should be put into abeyance until P.39/2015 had been debated. Members noted that the debate on P.39/2015 was due to take place on 14th July 2015.

On the topic of P.39/2015, Deputy S.M. Brée of St. Clement requested that his dissent from the Committee's proposition be recorded on the principle of cost. He considered that it would be inappropriate to introduce such a growth item during a time of economic challenge in which many people faced the threat of losing their jobs.

Register of
Names and
Addresses
(Comparison
with Electoral
Registers)
(Jersey)
Regulations
201-
756/1(4)

A7. The Committee, with reference to its Minute No. A9 of 21st April 2015, received an oral update from the Assistant Greffier of the States in respect of the "Draft Register of Names and Addresses (Comparison with Electoral Registers) (Jersey) Regulations 201-."

The Committee recalled that, in December 2013, the Committee as previously constituted had agreed that the Association of Electoral Administrators should be appointed to conduct a feasibility study to establish whether the Names and Addresses Register could be used to generate the electoral register automatically without the need for the current annual registration process.

The Committee observed that the Regulations required to enable the trial to take place had been lodged by the Chief Minister on 14th May 2015 and would be debated by the States on 14th July 2015.

The Committee noted the position accordingly.